**EVALUATION REPORT**

**(As Per Rule 35 of PP Rules,2004)**

|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
| 1. | Name of Procuring Agency | **National Transmission and Despatch Co. Ltd (NTDCL)** |
| 2. | Method of Procurement | **International Competitive Bidding (ICB)** |
| 3. | Title of Procurement | PROCUREMENT OF MATERIAL FOR 220KV T/LINE FROM GHARO GRID STATION TO JHIMPIR GRID STATION . |
| 4. | Tender Inquiry No. | **WPP-07-2014** |
| 5. | PPRA Ref. No. (TSE) | **TS209802E** |
| 6. | Date & Time of Bid Closing | **05/08/2014 11:00 A.M.** |
| 7. | Date & Time of Bid Opening | **05/08/2014 11:30 A.M.** |
| 8. | No of Bids Received | **24** |
| 9. | Criteria for Bid Evaluation | **Evaluation and Comparison of Bid as per Section-I “Instructions to Bidders” of Bidding Documents** |
| 10. | Details of Bid(s) Evaluation |  |

**LOT-I**

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Name of Bidder** | **Marks** | | **Evaluated Cost** | **Rule/Regulation/SBD\*/Policy/Basis for Rejeciton/ Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004** |
| **Technical**  **(If Applicable)** | **Financial**  **(if applicable)** |
| M/s. Shangdon Dingchang Tower Manufacturing,  Co., China | Nil | Nil | US$ **2,714,864** (CIF) | Responsive |
| M/s. Shandong Jianxing Tower Co. China | Nil | Nil | **US$ 2,730,261**  (CIF) | Responsive |
| M/s. Zhejiang Shengda Steel Tower Manufacturing Co. China | Nil | Nil | **US$ 3,115,953**  (CIF) | Responsive |
| M/s. Sinosteel Equipment and Engg. Co. China | Nil | Nil | **RMB 21,699,071**  (CIF) | Non-Responsive  The amount of submitted bid security is less than 2%.  Signature on schedule of prices and form of bid and appendix to bid does not match with the signature of authorized representative.  End-user certificates are without signature and are in Chinese language.  Weights of towers are much less than required.  A number of submitted documents are not on prescribed format and are not signed. |
| M/s. PECO Lahore | Nil | Nil | **PKR 490,144,200 (Ex-works)** | Non Responsive  The bidder has submitted the bid security through General Insurance Co. Lahore against the requirement of scheduled bank of Pakistan. |

**LOT-II**

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Name of Bidder** | **Marks** | | **Evaluated Cost** | **Rule/Regulation/SBD\*/Policy/Basis for Rejection/ Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004** |
| **Technical**  **(If Applicable)** | **Financial**  **(if applicable)** |
| **M/s. Aerospace Electric Technology Co. Ltd., China** | **Nil** | **Nil** | **US$**  **4,497,444 (CIF)** | Non Responsive.  The bidder did not take into account the amendment issued by CE. (MP&M) and quoted bid price for 1034 KM. Greeley conductor instead of amended quantity of 2034 KM. |
| **M/s. Sinosteel Equipment and Engg. Co. China** | **Nil** | **Nil** | **RMB 30,859,650 (CIF)** | Non Responsive  The bidder did not take into account the amendment issued by CE. (MP&M) and quoted bid price for 1034 km Greeley conductor instead of amended quantity of 2034 km. |
| **M/s. Zhongli Sci Tech Group. Co. Ltd., China** | **Nil** | **Nil** | **US$ 7,401,992 (CIF)** | Responsive. |
| **M/s. Hangzu Cable Co. Ltd., China** | **Nil** | **Nil** | **US$ 7,469,000 (CIF)** | Responsive |
| **M/s. Fujikura Hengtong Aerial Cable System Ltd., China** | **Nil** | **Nil** | **US$ 7,498,876 (CIF)** | Non Responsive  The bidder does not possess the required satisfactory manufacturing and operational experience. |
| **M/s. Wuxi Jiangnan Cable Co. Ltd. China** | **Nil** | **Nil** | **US$ 7,575,700 (CIF)** | Non Responsive  The bidder does not meeting the qualification and experience criteria. |
| **M/s. Jiangsu Zhongtian Tech Co. Ltd., (ZTT) China** | **Nil** | **Nil** | **US$ 7,789,100 (CIF)** | Responsive. |

**LOT-III**

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Name of Bidder** | **Marks** | | **Evaluated Cost** | **Rule/Regulation/SBD\*/Policy/Basis for Rejection/ Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004** |
| **Technical**  **(If Applicable)** | **Financial**  **(if applicable)** |
| **M/s. Jiangsu Zhongtian Tech Co. Ltd (ZTT) China** | **Nil** | **Nil** | **US$ 147,059 (CIF)** | Responsive. |
| **M/s. Fujikura Hengtong Aerial Cable System Ltd., China** | **Nil** | **Nil** | **US$ 148,078 (CIF)** | Responsive |
| **M/s. Shenzhen SDG Information Co. Ltd., China** | **Nil** | **Nil** | **US$ 155,488 (CIF)** | Non-Responsive  The bidder did not provide technical data of offer OPGW, UGFOC and joint boxes. The bidder did not submit supply record of offer OPGW. |
| **M/s. Suzhou Furukawa Power Optic Cable Co. Ltd., China** | **Nil** | **Nil** | **US$ 190,275 (CIF)** | Non Responsive  The name of the bidder in bid security form is M/s. Multiline Enterprises New Garden Town, Lahore whereas in Letter of Offer , Power of Attorney, Schedule of Prices Qualification Form and all other bid related documents, the name of bidder is M/s. **Suzhou Furukawa Power Optic Cable Co. Ltd., China**. The submitted bid security is not acceptable as it is not in the name of actual bidder. |
| **M/s. Sinosteel Equipment and Engg. Co. China** | **Nil** | **Nil** | **RMB 1,778,535 (CIF)** | Non Responsive  The amount of submitted B/Security is less than 2%.  The bidder has submitted incomplete and un-signed technical data of OPGW.  Signature on schedule of prices and form of bid and appendixes to bid does not match with signature of authorized representative |

**LOT-IV**

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Name of Bidder** | **Marks** | | **Evaluated Cost** | **Rule/Regulation/SBD\*/Policy/Basis for Rejection/ Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004** |
| **Technical**  **(If Applicable)** | **Financial**  **(if applicable)** |
| **M/s. Power China Henan Electric Equipment Material Co. China** | **Nil** | **Nil** | **US$ 274,847.80 (CIF)** | Non Responsive  The format of submitted bid security is not conformance with the bidding documents.  The bid is also technically non compliant due to number of technical deviations  Previous supply experience of bidder could not be ascertained.  The bidder has submitted number of un-signed bid forms.  Bank Certificate (QF-10) have been not provided. |
| **M/s. Gaungzhou Xinyuan Hengye Power Transmission Device Co. Ltd., China** | **Nil** | **Nil** | **US$ 291,676.59 (CIF)** | Responsive.  Initially, the Evaluation Committee has evaluated M/s. Guangzhou Xinyuan China as lowest responsive bidder and is recommended for award of contract. However, later on Evaluation Committee, vide CE (Design) NTDCL letter dated 10/02/2015 alter their decision on the following grounds.  1. **M/s. Gaungzhou Xinyuan China** has already been awarded following NTDCL Projects.  a) Hardware (SPP-01-2013-L-V)  b) Dampers (WPP-05-2014 L-V)  c) Hardware and dampers (WPP-08-2013 L-IV&VI)  But so far the said bidder has not delivered any material / equipment to NTDC. The material has not even been offered for pre-shipment inspection / type testing  2) Against a project of HESCO the bidder offered his material for type testing / pre-shipment inspection but the inspector reported that no test set up was available for the specified tests and the manufacturer did not perform any test. The inspectors came back without conducting any test due to non cooperation of the manufacturer.  3) NTDC projects are delayed due to non availability of material at site and the delivery period has long since expired.  Keeping in view the poor performance of the manufacturer in the recent HESCO contract, CE (Design) NTDCL has already recommended to issue a final notice of default to the manufacturer against already awarded projects. |
| **M/s. SA-RA Turkey** | **Nil** | **Nil** | **US$ 380,360 (CIF)** | Responsive. |
| **M/s. Alda Iran** | **Nil** | **Nil** | **US$ 412,543 (CIF)** | Non-Responsive.  The bidder has not supplied any financial documents i.e. audited financial statements, bank certificate etc with the bid.  The bidder has not submitted schedule C to F including the delivery schedule.  Bidder had not submitted qualification form QF-1,2,4 to 9.  Bidder has submitted un-filled appendixs C,E,F,& G.  Bidder has not provided any information regarding manufacturing capacity, orders in hand, orders in pipeline etc. |
| **M/s. Namdar Afroz Electrical Industrial Engg. Co. Iran** | **Nil** | **Nil** | **US$ 438,169.43** | Responsive. |
| **M/s. SinoSteel Equipment and Engg. Co. China** | **Nil** | **Nil** | **RMB 2,863,643 (CIF)** | Non Responsive  The amount of submitted Bid Security is less than 2%.  From the supply record and end user certificates provided in the bid satisfactory supply experience of T/Line hardware could not be ascertain.  Bidder has not provided any information regarding manufacturing capacity, order in hand, order in pipeline etc due to which capacity and capability of the bidder cannot be determine.  The bidder is also compliance due to number of technical deviations. |
| **M/s. Yaragh Avaran Pooya Engg. Iran** | **Nil** | **Nil** | **US$ 579,501.60 (CIF)** | Responsive. |

**LOT-VA**

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Name of Bidder** | **Marks** | | **Evaluated Cost** | **Rule/Regulation/SBD\*/Policy/Basis for Rejection/ Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004** |
| **Technical**  **(If Applicable)** | **Financial**  **(if applicable)** |
| **M/s. Shandong High Voltage Porcelain Insulator Co. Ltd, China** | **Nil** | **Nil** | **US$ 311,500 (CIF)** | Responsive |
| **M/s. Sinosteel Equipment and Engg Co. Ltd., China** | **Nil** | **Nil** | **RMB 2,442,000 (CIF)** | Non-Responsive  The amount of submitted Bid Security is less than 2%.  From the supply record and end user certificates provided in the bid satisfactory supply experience of T/Line hardware could not be ascertain.  Bidder has not provided any information regarding manufacturing capacity, order in hand, order in pipeline etc due to which capacity and capability of the bidder cannot be determine.  The bidder is also compliance due to number of technical deviations. |
| **M/s. Dalian Insulators Groups China** | **Nil** | **Nil** | **US$ 449,750 (CIF)** | Responsive |
| **M/s. EMCO Industries Lahore** | **Nil** | **Nil** | **PKR 54,215,000 (Ex-works)** | Responsive |
| **M/s. Egyptian Co. for manufacturing electrical insulator Egypt** | **Nil** | **Nil** | **US$ 1,072,225 (CIF)** | Non Responsive  The bid is also technical non compliant due to number of major technical deviations.  The bidder does not possess the requisite manufacturing and supply experience criteria mentioned in the bid  The bidder has not submitted the audited balance sheet for the last three years |

**LOT-VB**

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Name of Bidder** | **Marks** | | **Evaluated Cost** | **Rule/Regulation/SBD\*/Policy/Basis for Rejection/ Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004** |
| **Technical**  **(If Applicable)** | **Financial**  **(if applicable)** |
| **M/s. Shandong High Voltage Porcelain Insulator Co. Ltd., China** | **Nil** | **Nil** | **US$ 368,600 (CIF)** | Responsive |
| **M/s. Sinosteel Equipment and Engg Co. Ltd., China** | **Nil** | **Nil** | **RMB 2,331,000 (CIF)** | Non responsive  Security is less than 2%.  From the supply record and end user certificates provided in the bid satisfactory supply experience of T/Line hardware could not be ascertain.  Bidder has not provided any information regarding manufacturing capacity, order in hand, order in pipeline etc due to which capacity and capability of the bidder cannot be determine.  The bidder is also compliance due to number of technical deviations |
| **M/s. Dalian Insulator Groups China** | **Nil** | **Nil** | **US$ 430,000 + 35,000 (CIF)** | Responsive |
| **M/s. Egyptian Co. for manufacturing electrical insulator Egypt** | **Nil** | **Nil** | **US$ 764,500 (CIF)** | Non Responsive  The bid is also technical non compliant due to number of major technical deviations.  The bidder does not possess the requisite manufacturing and supply experience criteria mentioned in the bid  The bidder has not submitted the audited balance sheet for the last three years |

**LOT-VI**

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Name of Bidder** | **Marks** | | **Evaluated Cost** | **Rule/Regulation/SBD\*/Policy/Basis for Rejection/ Acceptance as per Rule 35 of PP Rules, 2004** |
| **Technical**  **(If Applicable)** | **Financial**  **(if applicable)** |
| **M/s. Guangzhou Xinyuan Hengye Power Transmission device Co. Ltd. China** | **Nil** | **Nil** | **US$ 112,901.36 (CIF)** | Responsive  Initially, the Evaluation Committee has evaluated M/s. Guangzhou Xinyuan China as lowest responsive bidder and is recommended for award of contract. However, later on Evaluation Committee, vide CE (Design) NTDCL letter dated 10/02/2015 alter their decision on the following grounds.  1. **M/s. Gaungzhou Xinyuan China** has already been awarded following NTDCL Projects.  a) Hardware (SPP-01-2013-L-V)  b) Dampers (WPP-05-2014 L-V)  c) Hardware and dampers (WPP-08-2013 L-IV&VI)  But so far the said bidder has not delivered any material / equipment to NTDC. The material has not even been offered for pre-shipment inspection / type testing  2) Against a project of HESCO the bidder offered his material for type testing / pre-shipment inspection but the inspector reported that no test set up was available for the specified tests and the manufacturer did not perform any test. The inspectors came back without conducting any test due to non cooperation of the manufacturer.  3) NTDC projects are delayed due to non availability of material at site and the delivery period has long since expired.  Keeping in view the poor performance of the manufacturer in the recent HESCO contract, CE (Design) NTDCL has already recommended to issue a final notice of default to the manufacturer against already awarded projects. |
| **M/s. Namdar Afroz Electrical Industrial Engg Co. Iran** | **Nil** | **Nil** | **US$ 157,700 (CIF)** | Responsive |
| **M/s. Yargha Avaran Pooya Engg. Iran** | **Nil** | **Nil** | **US$ 195,108(CIF)** | Responsive |
| **M/s. Alda Iran** | **Nil** | **Nil** | **US$ 180,603.77 (CIF)** | Non-responsive.  The bidder has not supplied any financial documents i.e. audited financial statements, bank certificate etc with the bid.  The bidder has not submitted schedule C to F including the delivery schedule.  Bidder had not submitted qualification form QF-1,2,4 to 9.  Bidder has submitted un-filled appendixs C,E,F,& G.  Bidder has not provided any information regarding manufacturing capacity, orders in hand, orders in pipeline etc. |
| **M/s. SA-RA Turkey** | **Nil** | **Nil** | **US$ 200,299.52 (CIF)** | Responsive |
| **M/s. Power China Henan Electric Equipment & Engg Co. China** | **Nil** | **Nil** | **US$ 232,045.04**  **(CIF)** | Non Responsive  The format of submitted bid security is not conformance with the bidding documents.  The bid is also technically non compliant due to number of technical deviations  Previous supply experience of bidder could not be ascertain.  The bidder has submitted number of un-signed bid forms.  Bank Certificate (QF-10) have been not provided. |
| **M/s. Sinosteel Equipment and Engg. Co. China** | **Nil** | **Nil** | **RMB 1,982,888 (CIF)** | Non Responsive.  The amount of submitted Bid Security is less than 2%.  From the supply record and end user certificates provided in the bid satisfactory supply experience of T/Line hardware could not be ascertain.  Bidder has not provided any information regarding manufacturing capacity, order in hand, order in pipeline etc due to which capacity and capability of the bidder cannot be determine.  The bidder is also compliance due to number of technical deviations. |

**LOT-VI**

|  |
| --- |
| **Retender against Lot-VII** |

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| **Lowest Evaluated Responsive Bidder (Lot-I)** | M/s. Shandong Dingchang Tower Manufacturing Co. Ltd., China |
| **Lowest Evaluated Responsive Bidder (Lot-II)** | M/s. Zhongli Sci-Tech Group Co. China |
| **Lowest Evaluated Responsive Bidder (Lot-III)** | M/s. Jiangsu Zhongtian Technology Co. Ltd (ZTT) China |
| **Lowest Evaluated Responsive Bidder (Lot-IV)** | M/s. SA-RA Turkey |
| **Lowest Evaluated Responsive Bidder (Lot-VA)** | M/s. Shandong High Voltage Porcelain Insulators Co. Ltd., China |
| **Lowest Evaluated Responsive Bidder (Lot-VB)** | M/s. Shandong High Voltage Porcelain Insulators Co. Ltd., China |
| **Lowest Evaluated Responsive Bidder (Lot-VI)** | M/s. Namdar Afroz Electrical Industrial Engg Co. Iran |
| **11. Any other additional/supporting information, the procuring agency may like to share** | Nil |

Signature \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

Official Stamp \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_